## Penn Fellowships in Neuroscience & Society



### Neurolaw Afternoon



### fMRI Lie Detection



## Lie detection 101

- Two main approaches
  - Comparison question method
  - Guilty knowledge method



## Lie detection 101

- Two main approaches
  - Comparison question method
  - Guilty knowledge method
- Did you kill a man in Reno?
  - If subject lies, expect greater physic response to this question than to other emotional questions (eg, Have you ever stolen?)



## Lie detection 101

- Two main approaches
  - Comparison question method
  - Guilty knowledge method
- Did you kill a man in Reno?
  - If subject lies, expect greater physic response to this question than to other emotional questions (eg, Have you ever stolen?)
- Did the knife have a wooden handle?
  - If the subject knows about the murder weapon, the correct description will "ring a bell"/"click" and this will be reflected in physiology



## Lie detection 101, continued

- How to measure the physiological impact of giving a deceitful answer or recognizing features of the crime?
- Deception increases autonomic nervous system arousal
  - Sympathetic division activates during arousal, emotion





# Measuring sympathetic nervous system activity for lie detection

- Ancient China:
  - Interrogate with dry rice in mouth
- 20<sup>th</sup> Century, US and elsewhere, "polygraph"
  - Blood pressure
  - Respiration
  - Heart rate
  - Sweat

Sympathetic division (arousing)		Parasympathetic division (calming)
Pupils dilate	EYES	Pupils contract
Decreases	SALIVATION	Increases
Perspires	SKIN	Dries
Increases	RESPIRATION	Decreases
Accelerates	HEART	Slows
Inhibits	DIGESTION	Activates
Secrete stress	ADRENAL	Decrease secretion

## History of the polygraph



- William Moulton Marston's undergraduate research project at Harvard
  - Blood pressure goes up when lying (Comparison Question) or hearing relevant crime facts (Guilty Knowledge)
- Later workers added respiration, HR and GSR



## Polygraph



Note aura of science ( = objectivity, certainty, authority)

Center for Neuroscience & Society

## Does it work?

- Yes and no (mainly no).
  - Accuracy depends on who's measuring
  - Hard to measure accuracy in real world situations
  - Does "work" mean better than guessing? 75%? 99%?
  - Especially bad for screening (low base rate)



• Despite this...

Center for Neuroscience & Society University of Pennsylvania

## Intelligence





### Use in criminal investigation

#### THE CITY OF SANTA BARBARA

<u>Home</u> > <u>Government</u> > <u>City Departments</u> > Police

#### **City Calendar**

Accessibility

#### -----

American Recovery and Reinvestment Act of 2009

Boards & Commissions: General Info

Boards &

Commissions: A - C

Boards & Commissions: D - M

Boards & Commissions: N - Z

Other Committees

Hearing Agendas

Budget & Financial Information

City Departments

City Directory

City Hall

City Meetings & Videos Online

**City Publications** 



Frequently Asked Questions about Polygraphs

#### Q. When are Polygraphs used?

**A:** The Santa Barbara Police Department conducts pre-employment polygraph examinations for most positions at the police department. They are conducted to verify information, qualifications, past criminal or drug history, if any.

The Santa Barbara Police Department also conducts criminal polygraphs on suspects or persons to find out if they committed a particular crime or to exonerate them from suspicion of criminal activity.



#### Search:

## Polygraph and the law

- Employee Polygraph Protection Act of 1988
- Criteria for admissibility of scientific evidence
  - Frye (1923 actually concerned polygraph)
    - Has the new method "gained general acceptance in the particular field in which it belongs"
  - Daubert (1993 concerning drug and birth defects)
    - More flexibility



### What's past is prologue





### ERP and fMRIrain-based lie detection: Even *more* scientific impressiveness Even *less* empirical validation

Center for Neuroscience & Society University of Pennsylvania

## ERP markers of guilty knowledge

#### • "Brain Finger-Printing"

Red: Information the suspect is expected to know.

- Green: Information not known to suspect.
- Blue: Information of the crime that only perpetrator would

#### NOT GUILTY

Because the blue and green lines closely correlate, suspect does not have critical knowledge of the crime.

#### GUILTY

Because the blue and red lines closely correlate, suspect has critical knowledge of the crime.



For more information see: www.brainwavescience.com.



 Admitted for reversal of Terry Harrington's murder conviction

Center for Neuroscience & Society University of Pennsylvania

## ERP markers of guilty knowledge

• Brain Electrical Oscillations Signature (BEOS)



- Used to convict Aditi Sharma of murder
- As of 2009 over 300
   suspects or witnesses
   have taken the BEOS
   test

### fMRI lie detection

- Starting in 2002, studies of the neural bases of deception
  - Basic research with simple tasks, eg Langleben's playing card task: subject gets a card, must conceal its identity while being shown many cards and asked, for each one, "is this your card?"
  - How does this differ from real world deception?



### Activation associated with deception

• Is there a "brain signature" of deception?

Ie could lying be like face perception?

Is there a "Prefrontal Prevarication (lying) Area," analogous to the Fusiform Face Area?



Center for Neuroscience & Society University of Pennsylvania

# A constellation of areas typically, but not invariably, activated



Across studies, dorsolateral PFC, ventrolateral PFC, posterior parietal, anterior insula, anterior cingulate
Locations of lie-truth difference vary
Regions associated with effort and cognitive control
le not specific to lying



### Multivariate techniques



 How well can we discriminate lies from truth using all the (inconsistent and nonspecific) information?



## Major outstanding problems

- In the lab, confounds: deception trials also more familiar, different response demands
- Outside the lab, no relevant evidence





Center for Neuroscience & Society

#### Welcome to Cephos Corp - Microsoft Internet Explorer

#### <u>File Edit View Favorites Tools Help</u>

Address a http://www.cephoscorp.com/



CEPHOS CORPORATION uses the latest advances in medical imaging to peer inside the inner workings of the brain during deception. Our goal is to develop accurate tools to detect lying.

Lying is shown to activate specific, discrete parts of the brain. We can use these regions to determine if a person is lying with a high degree of accuracy. No activation is seen when telling the truth.

Standard magnetic resonance imaging (MRI) technology is used to detect brain activations. This technique is referred to as functional magnetic resonance imaging (fMRI).

Over the last six years, this technology has been used in a series of studies to detect the neuronal basis of deception. fMRI has numerous advantages over standard "lie detectors" including:

o Accurate - currently 90% accuracy in clinical testing.

- Machine-based all analysis performed using automated computer analysis.
- Non-subjective humans do not ask the questions or examine the scans.
- Validated algorithms uses algorithms used and developed in thousands of clinical studies.

Areas appearing in red

represent activated regions of

the brain when telling a lie.

CEPHOS continues to test and validate the technology with the goal of achieving 95% accuracy. Based on valid clinical results in 2006, the company intends to offer this service in the first half of this year.

Center for Neuroscience & Society

From: Martha Farah [mfarah@psych.upenn.edu] Received: 2/6/10 4:35 PM	
Subje From Steven J. Laken, Ph.D. 1	Seply → Forward Archive ↓ Archiv
Subject RE: seeking reference citation	2/6/10 5:45 P
Dear I 💦 To Martha Farah 🚖	Other Action

I'm pu The references are on the website. The 97% is documented and has not been subjected to peer review however it has been publis reviewed by our scientific panel.

Cephi Steven J. Laken, Ph.D. than 3 President and CEO Cephos Corp. Thank P.O. Box 45 Tyngsboro, MA 01879 Marth Direct: 978.319.4542 Fax: 978.856.3350 Marth Main: 978.703.4725

This email message and any attachments are being sent by Cephos Corp., are confidential, and may be privileged. The Content of this e-mail does not convey legal, accounting, tax, career or other professional advice of any kind. If you are not the intended recipient, please notify us immediately -- by replying to this message or by sending an email to cephos@cephoscorp.com -- and destroy all copies of this message and any attachments. Thank you.

-----Original Message-----From: Martha Farah [mfarah@psych.upenn.edu] Received: 2/6/10 4:35 PM To: Steven J. Laken, Ph.D. [slaken@CEPHOSCORP.COM] Subject: seeking reference citation



## Daubert hearing 2010





Daubert hearing on fMRI lie detection in Memphis Federal Court, 2010

Center for Neuroscience & Society

### Evidence in science and law

- Truth.
- Truth, as best we can determine it, for practical purposes
  - The jury, not a lie detector, decides what is true... Lie detector evidence may help the jury decide



## Not admitted, but...

- Judge Tu Pham:
- "in the future, should fMRI-based lie detection undergo further testing, development and peer review, improve upon standards controlling the technique's operation, and gain acceptance by the scientific community for use in the real world, this methodology may be found to be admissible even if the error rate is not found to be quantified in a real world setting."



## Roles of neuroscience in law

- 1. Ammunition for attack on very idea of legal or moral responsibility and implications for punishment
- 2. Handmaiden to psychology
  - NGRI
  - Adolescent culpability
  - Mitigation at sentencing
- 3. Other
  - Detection of deception
  - Also: Screening and predicton, Therapeutic sentencing, Memory dampening, Pain detection...

Center for Neuroscience & Society

## Thank you!



#### How can we determine real-world validity?

- Peter Imrey (2010): a "clinical trial"
  - Cases selected prior to review of evidence
  - Scan defendants
  - Later, examine cases in which indisputable evidence came to light
- Cost estimated in the range of \$10<sup>8</sup>

